

## 1. STONNINGTON INDOOR SPORTS STADIUM - ASSESSMENT OF ALTERNATE SITES

**Manager Community Facilities: Tony Oulton**  
**General Manager Community & Culture: Karen Watson**

### PURPOSE

The purpose of this report is to present the findings of the assessment of three possible alternate sites for the Stonnington Indoor Sports Stadium.

### BACKGROUND

On 21 November 2016 as an item of confidential business it was resolved that Council:

1. *Endorse Percy Treyvaud Memorial Park as the preferred site for the proposed Stonnington Indoor Sports Stadium.*
2. *Completes a feasibility study into the proposed development of an indoor stadium at Percy Treyvaud Memorial Park with a minimum of 4 courts.*
3. *Include as part of the feasibility study opportunities to accommodate the Chadstone Bowls Club and/or its members at alternate locations and the future provision of active recreation programs and services for older adults as part of that study.*

At the Council Meeting on 10 July 2017, a Notice of Motion to further expand the scope of the project was endorsed by Council. Specifically, Notice of Motion No. 1/2017: Indoor Stadium Feasibility Study, stipulated that:

*Three possible alternate sites be subjected to a more rigorous assessment by an independent Consultancy that has professional expertise across a range of disciplines including master planning, urban planning and design and landscape architecture.*

1. *These sites include:*
  - *The Malvern Valley Golf Course*
  - *The Orrong-Romanis Reserve*
  - *The Car Park opposite the East Malvern RSL Club site*
2. *A report be brought back to Council on 21 August 2017. (Council meeting six weeks after the meeting on 10 July 2017).*
3. *The community continue to be kept informed of the progress of this additional study through our website and social media.*
4. *It be noted that the feasibility study will simultaneously continue looking at the site within the Percy Treyvaud Memorial Park in preparation for a report to be brought back to Council no later than 30 November 2017.*

Hansen Partnership was engaged to undertake the more rigorous assessment of the three sites nominated by Council for further investigation.

### DISCUSSION

In accordance with Notice of Motion No. 1/2017, three sites were subjected to a more rigorous assessment.

This assessment included gathering general information about the three sites including location, spatial characteristics, adjacent uses, planning, traffic and services.

The independent assessment of three possible alternate sites is included as Attachment 1 to this report.

This assessment concluded that Malvern Valley Golf Course and the car park opposite East Malvern RSL Club are not viable options for the indoor sports stadium.

Two options within Orrong Romanis Reserve were identified. Orrong Reserve - North was of limited potential due to the height of the proposed building which is not responsive to the building character in the immediately adjacent streets, and the congestion in these streets stemming from traffic accessing the basement carpark.

The only option recommended for consideration and further investigation is Orrong Romanis Reserve – South and involves:

- Demolition of the existing two-court Orrong Romanis Recreation Centre
- Construction of 5 tennis courts on the current site of the Orrong Romanis Recreation Centre
- Construction of a six-court stadium in a two level configuration (3 courts on top of 3 courts) with two levels of basement carparking, on the site of the current Orrong Romanis Tennis Centre.

Further investigation since the receipt of this assessment has included independent planning advice, a preliminary geotechnical and environmental investigation of the site, and the receipt of an indicative cost plan.

#### Planning Considerations

Independent advice from a planning consultant regarding the statutory planning implications for such a development was sought by Hansen Partnership.

Based upon that advice there is good access to the site, there are no restrictive overlays, and the site is not located in an area of cultural heritage significance. There are a lot of significant trees within the reserve and minimising the loss of vegetation would be important.

A planning permit for buildings and works would be required, and the development of land in the Public Park & Recreation Zone where there is not an incorporated plan will have to be advertised to the adjoining land owners.

A two-storey stadium would be approximately 22 metres high. No height controls exist on the site that would prohibit this development and the higher built form would be adjacent to buildings of a similar height.

#### Existing Ground Conditions

Historical records indicate that the land that is now Orrong Romanis Reserve, was a clay pit and a rubbish tip for the City of Prahran at the beginning of the twentieth century.

Based upon the statewide geological database the site was more likely a sand pit than a clay pit, and the rubbish tip was presumably in a worked out section of the sand pit.

A preliminary geotechnical and environmental investigation to establish the existing ground conditions was commissioned to inform the feasibility of constructing a stadium above two levels of basement carparking on the site.

Borehole samples were taken at three locations outside the existing tennis court enclosure. Results of these tests indicate the south-west and north-west corners of the tennis courts are outside the old sand pit area where there is shallow fill (depth of approximately 1.2m) over natural soil, whilst the mid-north side is probably inside the old tip area and was all fill to a depth of 9m.

### Engineering Considerations

The sub-surface conditions vary and the design of the buildings footings will need to accommodate this variability. Based upon the preliminary investigation, a combination of spread footings to support internal columns, bored piles to support external loads and a suspended floor slab on deep footings would be required.

The engineering considerations for the basement retaining wall will also vary between areas outside and inside the old sand pit envelope.

Further investigation would be required to inform the detailed design considerations for the proposed building.

Groundwater was detected at one location at a depth of about 8m. Further investigation would be required to accurately determine the depth of groundwater at the site, and any contamination in that groundwater.

### Soil Contamination

The environmental laboratory tests indicate a significant degree of chemical contamination in the sub-surface soil at all three sample locations. Contaminated soils are classified as Category A (most contaminated), B or C (least contaminated). All soil samples tested contained contaminants from these categories.

Despite the presence of these contaminants in the sub-surface soil, the reserve is adequately capped to ensure there is no risk to the safety of existing users.

Category A contaminated waste is banned from landfill in Victoria and requires treatment on-site so that it can be reclassified before disposal. The cost of remediation is significant and time consuming and the options for undertaking the required treatment on site at Orrong Romanis Reserve is limited. Additional testing would be required to establish the extent of Category A contamination on the site. Category B and Category C contaminants can be disposed of in an EPA licenced facility.

Allowing for a basement depth of 7.8m during construction on the current tennis court enclosure (100m x 38m = 3800m<sup>2</sup>), the excavation required would produce approximately 29,640m<sup>3</sup> of fill for removal and disposal. Based upon the profile of the soil samples assessed as part of this preliminary environmental investigation, an estimate of the cost of disposing of this fill would be \$11.909 million. This disposal cost does not include the necessary on-site treatment of any Category A contamination before it is reclassified as Category B contamination.

### Cost Estimate

An indicative cost plan for a 6-court indoor sports stadium built on two levels with two levels of basement carparking is \$37.5 million.

The engineering considerations in the design of the footings and basement retaining walls that the geotechnical investigation identifies, the noise attenuation treatments that will be required and further design modifications will all increase the final project cost to approximately \$40.2 million.

Furthermore an allowance for remediation of the contaminated soil conditions on site that will be required. The disposal of Category B and C contaminants is estimated to cost \$11.909 million. There would be further costs associated with the treatment of Category A contaminants on site.

The estimated project cost for the construction of the proposed indoor sports stadium and associated basement carparking on this location is at least \$51.1 million.

### **POLICY IMPLICATIONS**

The Stonnington Recreation Strategy 2014-2024 includes Equitable Provision as one of its six priorities and an action to conduct a feasibility study into the construction of a new multi-court indoor stadium to service the needs of indoor court users.

The decision to nominate Percy Treyvaud Memorial Park as the preferred site for the proposed Stonnington Indoor Sports Stadium was consistent with Council's Recreation Strategy (2014) and Strategies for Creating Open Space, as would be the case for the Orrong Romanis Reserve - South option.

### **FINANCIAL AND RESOURCES IMPLICATIONS**

The cost to date to undertake the assessment of three possible alternate sites and gather further information on one of the options is \$26,225 and is in addition to the original estimated cost of the feasibility study of \$100,000.

Based on the information available to inform a preliminary concept plan, and the predicted costs escalations, the indicative cost of the Orrong Romanis Reserve – South option the final project cost could be at least \$51.1 million.

Council has allocated \$24.8 million dollars towards the provision of indoor courts from within the strategic resource plan as follows:

2018/19 \$ 1,000,000

2019/20 \$11,300,000

2020/21 \$12,500,000

This includes \$4 million that has been committed to the project by the Commonwealth Department of Infrastructure and Regional Development and the opportunity to apply for a further \$3 million from the Victorian Government's Better Indoor Stadiums Funding Program. This amount was allocated based upon the indicative cost estimate for the indoor sports stadium on the site of the Chadstone Bowls Club when Council resolved to undertake a feasibility study on that option.

On current estimates additional funding of up to \$26.3 million would need to be found to deliver the Orrong Romanis Reserve – South option if it were to cost \$51.1 million.

### **CONCLUSION**

The findings from the independent assessment of three sites endorsed as part of the Notice of Motion, will be included within the final report of the feasibility study to be reported to Council no later than 20 November 2017.

Based on the findings of the independent assessment no further action or investigation into Malvern Valley Golf Course and the carpark opposite the East Malvern RSL Club is recommended.

Further investigation of Orrong Romanis Reserve has identified existing conditions and indicative costs that would have a significant impact on Council's ability to construct an indoor sports stadium at this location.

### **HUMAN RIGHTS CONSIDERATION**

This recommendation complies with the Victorian Charter of Human Rights and Responsibilities Act 2006.

**ATTACHMENTS**

1. Stonnington Indoor Sports Stadium - Assessment of Alternate Sites Excluded

**RECOMMENDATION**

***That Council note the contents of this report and the findings of the more rigorous assessment of three sites endorsed as part of Notice of Motion No. 1/2017: Indoor Stadium Feasibility Study, for inclusion in the final Stonnington Indoor Sports Stadium Feasibility Study report.***